

Committees: Corporate Projects Board - <i>for information</i> Housing Management and Almshouses Sub - <i>for decision</i> Project and Procurement Sub - <i>for information</i>	Dates: 08 October 2025 26 November 2025 28 January 2026
Subject: Petticoat Tower Fire Doors Unique Project Identifier: 11984	Gateway 6: Outcome Report Light
Report of: Director of Community & Children's Services Report Author: Neil Clutterbuck	For Decision
PUBLIC	

Summary

1. Status update	Project Description: Installation of FD60 Fire Door sets to residential properties and the removal of notifiable asbestos bulkhead boarding to flats A and D at Petticoat Tower in Middlesex Street Estate. RAG Status: Green (Red at last report to Chief Officer) Risk Status: Low (Low at last report to Chief Officer) Costed Risk Provision Utilised: N/A Final Outturn Cost: £298,471.41
2. Next steps and requested decisions	Requested Decisions: 1. To note the content of this report, 2. To note the lessons learnt, 3. To authorise closure of this project.

Main Report

Design & Delivery Review

3. Design into delivery	The design of the project ensured successful delivery with no significant issues.
4. Options appraisal	Overall, the chosen option had a successful outcome and all deliverables were achieved.
5. Procurement route	A full, compliant tender process for the works was completed in conjunction with the City Procurement Service (CPS).

	The initial appointment of Ventro Group was via a compliant open tender process. The subsequent appointment of Gerda was via a direct award using the Hyde Framework.
6. Skills base	The design and delivery of the project was achieved using existing internal resource without the need to appoint any external specialists.
7. Stakeholders	Residents and other key stakeholders were engaged with extensively throughout the design, development and delivery stages. The contractor appointed RLO was instrumental in ensuring that residents were kept informed and engaged throughout the delivery stages.

Variation Review

8. Assessment of project against key milestones	<p>The project progressed as expected throughout the design and procurement phases culminating in the approval of Gateway 5 in January 2019.</p> <p>At Gateway 5, procurement for a main contractor appeared successful with a decision taken to appoint Ventro Group to carry out the work. Shortly after commencing on site, Ventro Group applied for an initial variation amount of £50,000, stating that they had not allowed enough money in their tender submission for the removal of notifiable asbestos. A protracted negotiation, supported by City Solicitors, saw Ventro Group ultimately withdraw from the contract as they were unable to deliver for the tendered figure.</p> <p>An Issues Report was submitted in April 2020 seeking approval to re-let the contract via a direct award utilising the Hyde Framework to minimise any further loss to the programme. Approval was granted to appoint Gerda Security Products Ltd, the top ranked supplier from the framework. The cost impact of proceeding with Gerda was noted at the time of being some £20,000 plus lower than accepting the first of the variations requested by Ventro Group.</p> <p>The delay resulting from the abandoned appointment of Ventro Group, coupled with the challenges of delivering the contract through the unprecedented challenges on the Covid-19 public health crisis saw slippage to the forecast programme of 20 months.</p>
9. Assessment of project against Scope	No changes to scope of works were required for this project.
10. Risks and issues	Following the appointment of Gerda, risks were fully mitigated and there were no unidentified risks or major issues. No CRP was utilised.

11. Transition to BAU	The deliverables were executed as planned and the out turn was that residents were satisfied with the works, and how the installations were carried out. Following the conclusion of the defect liability period the ongoing maintenance of these units has been successfully transferred to the general R&M contractor.
------------------------------	--

Value Review

12. Budget	<i>Estimated Outturn Cost (G2)</i>		Estimated cost (including risk): £198,000 Estimated cost (excluding risk):£198,000
		<i>At Authority to Start work (G5)</i>	<i>Final Outturn Cost</i>
	Fees	£3,590.00	£1,590.00
	Staff Costs	£20,570.11	£13,481.91
	Works	£274,268.09	£281,399.50
	Total	£298,428.20	£298,471.41
	The Final Outturn Cost exceeds the approved Gateway 5 budget by £43.21. Final accounts have been subject to an independent verification check, undertaken by a suitably experienced officer within the relevant implementing department.		
13. Investment	N/A		
14. Assessment of project against SMART objectives	All property doors were replaced by certified FD60 door sets, meeting statutory fire safety and City standards. Replacement door sets offered residents improved acoustic, thermal and security features.		
15. Key benefits realised	All doors were replaced by Gerda Security fire doors as planned.		

Lessons Learned and Recommendations

16. Positive reflections	The removal of the asbestos bulkhead boarding swiftly followed by the subsequent fire door installation was very well managed by the project team logistically. The Gerda manufactured doors are of an extremely high standard and perform well in the City's residential estates.
17. Improvement reflections	The contract dispute with Ventro Group arose from their failure to adequately price the removal of technically challenging notifiable asbestos. Ideally, this should have been

	addressed during the tender evaluation stage as this was a specified item in the tender package. Ideally, this omission should have been challenged before the contract award. Ultimately, the subsequent appointment of Gerda delivered a satisfactory outcome to this project.
18. Sharing best practice	<p>1. Dissemination of key information through team and project staff briefings.</p> <p>2. Lessons learned have been logged and recorded on departmental SharePoint</p>
19. AOB	N/A

Appendices

Appendix 1	Project Coversheet
-------------------	--------------------

Contact

Report Author	Neil Clutterbuck
Email Address	Neil.clutterbuck1@cityoflondon.gov.uk
Telephone Number	07712 234438